

3. Adg³ 2 In 8²

COMPARATIVE SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS ON INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS BY PREVIOUS COMMISSIONS AND STUDY GROUPS

Governmental Function or Activity	"First Hoover" Commission ^{1/} (1949)	"Kestnbaum" Commission (1955)	Joint Federal-State Action Committee (1957-60)	"Fountain" Committee (1955-59)
A. Need for Survey and Appraisal of Intergovernmental Relations	<p>1. Recommends that functions and activities of government be appraised as to which can be most advantageously operated by the various levels of government and which require joint policy making, financing and administration.</p> <p>*2. Recommends that a continuing agency on Federal-State relations be created with primary responsibility for study, information and guidance in the field of Federal-State relations.</p>	<p>*1. Recommends a Special Assistant in the Executive Office of the President to serve as Presidential adviser on State and local relations.</p> <p>*2. Recommends a permanent Advisory Board on Intergovernmental Relations appointed by the President.</p> <p>*3. Recommends intensification of Budget Bureau concern with intergovernmental relations.</p> <p>*4. Recommends designation of Assistant Secretary for Intergovernmental Relations in certain departments.</p> <p>*5. Recommends maintenance of active subcommittees on intergovernmental relations in the Congressional Committees on Government Operations.</p>	<p>1. States that adequate attention by the States and Federal Government to emerging problems as they arise is the best procedure to insure the proper distribution of responsibilities among the various levels of government.</p> <p>*2. Recommends strengthening of liaison functions carried out by the Council of State Governments and the Office of the Deputy Assistant to the President for Intergovernmental Relations.</p>	<p>*1. Recommends establishment of an Advisory Commission on Intergovernmental Relations.</p> <p>*2. Strengthening of intergovernmental staff unit in the Executive Office of the President.</p>

^{1/} The Hoover Commission made no recommendations as to how specific functions should be allocated among levels of government

* Already adopted or implemented, wholly or in part

Governmental Function
or Activity

"First Hoover" Commission
(1949)

"Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955)

Joint Federal-State
Action Committee
(1957-60)

"Fountain" Committee
(1955-59)

B. Taxation and Revenues

1. General

1. Recommends that National, State and local tax systems be revised, leaving to localities and States adequate resources from which to raise revenue to meet the duties and responsibilities of local governments.

1. Opposes a clean division of tax sources; says some overlapping has positive advantages, but favors some (unspecified) reduction in overlapping.

2. Favors improved tax coordination (uniformity of bases, methods of computation) between National and State and local tax authorities.

3. Opposes endeavoring to exchange grants for tax sources.

1. Endorses a transfer of appropriate functions, wholly or in part to the States, to be accompanied by a relinquishment to the States of approximately commensurate National Government tax sources.

1. Favors making available to States and localities those revenue sources that are not of primary importance to the National Government and which are well adapted to State and local use

2. Opposes endeavoring to exchange grants for taxes.

2. Specific taxes

None

1. States not using them are encouraged to take advantage of general sales and income taxes.

1. Recommends the abandonment of 40 percent of the Federal telephone tax to the States, through the credit device.

None

2. Recommends intensive review of Federal estate tax to determine means of increasing State credit against the Federal tax and simplifying both Federal and State estate and inheritance taxes and standardizing the latter insofar as possible.

3. Payments in Lieu of
Taxes

None

1. Recommends enactment by the Congress of a program for payments to State and local governments in lieu of taxes on certain types of federally owned property.

1. Recommends that Congress set up a special commission to study the question of payments in lieu of taxes.

None

Governmental Function or Activity	"First Hoover" Commission (1949)	"Kestnbaum" Commission (1955)	Joint Federal-State Action Committee (1957-60)	"Fountain" Committee (1955-59)
<u>C. Grants-in-Aid-General</u>	<p>1. Recommends that grant-in-aid plans and programs be "clarified and systematized."</p> <p>*2. Recommends budgeting and administration of grant-in-aid funds on Federal and State levels in same way as other Federal and State funds.</p>	<p>1. Opposes initiation of Federal grants for purpose of equalizing interstate variations in tax sources.</p> <p>2. Opposes concept of comprehensive Federal subventions to States for general governmental purposes.</p> <p>3. When National action is called for, endorses use of grant-in-aid as one of several alternate possibilities, provided objective is clearly defined.</p> <p>4. Endorses, as appropriate purposes of grant-in-aid (a) stimulation; (b) transfer of a completely Federal activity to a cooperative Federal-State activity; and (c) compensation of local or State governments for unusual burdens created by Federal activity.</p> <p>5. Although opposed to use of grants for primary purpose of equalization, endorses use of an equalization factor if disparities in State fiscal capacity make it unlikely that grant's objective will be attained in low income States.</p>	<p>1. Recognizes that small stimulating grants may be occasionally helpful to (a) meet an emergency situation or (b) further a strong national objective.</p> <p>2. Recommends that such grants be based upon and accompanied by (a) careful selectivity; (b) clear-cut national interest; (c) mechanisms to prevent continued Federal operating responsibilities in spheres properly State and local in scope; and (d) utmost flexibility and control by States and localities in administration of the program and funds.</p>	<p>1. Recommends that new grant legislation include (a) clear definition of objective; (b) provision for periodic review of the program; and (c) where appropriate, a termination date.</p> <p>2. Recommends greater standardization of conditions and controls applicable to existing grant programs.</p> <p>3. Recommends authorization to transfer funds up to 20 percent among specific categories of existing "categorical grant" programs--specifically, public health and vocational education at the outset.</p> <p>4. Recommends consideration of amending Hatch Act so that penalty for violation is no greater for State and local employees paid from grant funds than for Federal employees under similar circumstances.</p>

Governmental Function
or Activity

"Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955)

Joint Federal-State Action Committee
(1957-60)

"Fountain" Committee
(1955-59)

D. Existing Grant-in-Aid
Programs

1. Vocational Education

1. Recommends legislation to limit Federal grants for vocational education to subjects vested with a clear and special national interest and elimination, after a reasonable period of time, of existing Federal grants not meeting these criteria.

1. Recommends transfer to States of full financial and administrative responsibility for vocational education and the withdrawal of the Federal Government from this field (in conjunction with telephone tax credit arrangement listed under B(2) above).

1. Recommends authorization to transfer funds up to 20 per cent among the specific categories of this program.

2. Public Health

1. Recommends continuance, with technical modifications, of Federal grants-in-aid for general health purposes and for specific categories.

1. Recommends that States be permitted to transfer up to one-third of any of eight categorical grants to other programs in the group.

1. Recommends authorization to transfer up to 20 per cent among the specific categories of this general program.

2. Recommends continuation, with modifications, of Federal grants for hospital construction.

3. Recommends decentralization of Federal research functions to institutions or States equipped to conduct such research.

3. Vocational Rehabilitation

1. Recommends expansion of Federal stimulating effort in this field and the achievement of minimum levels of vocational rehabilitation services throughout the States.

None

1. Recommends that Congress consider removing the rigid limitation on State choice of an appropriate agency for administering the vocational rehabilitation program.

2. Recommends that States be given latitude in deciding where organizationally to locate the vocational rehabilitation activity within the State government and be encouraged to establish an advisory council to such an agency.

Governmental Function
or Activity

"Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955)

Joint Federal-State Committee
(1957-60)

"Fountain" Committee
(1955-59)

4. Public Welfare

1. Recommends that "general assistance" continue to be a State and local financial responsibility.

2. Recommends a tapering-off of Federal grants for old-age assistance commensurate with decline in total Federal-State expenditures for this purpose.

* 3. Recommends a revised formula for Federal share of old-age assistance directed toward greater equalization.

4. Recommends continuation, with certain modifications, of Federal grants for dependent children, blind, permanently and totally disabled and child welfare service and extension of Federal grants to cover needy children receiving foster care.

None

* 1. Recommends that the Secretary of Health, Education and Welfare study and report on feasible methods for improving the "equitableness" of Federal financial participation in State programs for old-age assistance and other public assistance categories.

5. Highways

* 1. Recommends continuance and increase of Federal aid, allocated in terms of (a) highways of importance to national security and (b) a balanced program to serve the needs of an expanding economy; such increased aid to be financed on a pay-as-you-go basis financed primarily from motor fuel taxes.

2. Recommends a reduction in extent of Federal controls over highway grants-in-aid.

3. Recommends repeal of provision of Hayden-Cartwright Act requiring States to earmark portions of specific taxes for highway purposes.

None

1. Recommends consideration of repeal of provision of Hayden-Cartwright Act requiring States to earmark portions of specific taxes for highway purposes.

Governmental Function
or Activity

"Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955)

Joint Federal-State Committee
(1957-60)

"Fountain" Committee
(1955-59)

6. Employment Security

1. Recommends that 90 percent tax offset and 100 percent administrative grant be retained.
2. Recommends that reserve fund be usable for Federal administrative grants in years when grant requirements exceed 10 percent collections under Federal Unemployment Tax Act.
3. Recommends modification in Federal-State administrative relationships with respect to rule-making, compliance proceedings, auditing, purchasing, fiscal controls and administrative and program reporting.
4. Recommends that State employment security agency budget estimates flow through established budgetary and executive channels at the State level.
5. Recommends that President and Secretary of Labor recommend minimum standards as to eligibility and duration of benefits, etc., for inclusion in State laws.
6. Recommends national legislation to extend coverage to all employers of one or more.
7. Recommends continuation of experience-rating system.

None

1. Recommends consideration of amending Federal Unemployment Tax Act to permit States freedom to reduce tax rates on a flat rate basis, as an alternative to experience rating, provided that such action does not adversely affect the solvency of a State's trust fund.

Governmental Function
or Activity

"Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955)

Joint Federal-State Committee
(1957-60)

"Fountain" Committee
(1955-59)

7. Agriculture

1. Recommends continuation, with certain modifications, of the Federal grants for State experiment stations and extension services, including recommendation that these grants flow through regular budgetary and executive channels at the State level.
2. Recommends that States be given an option to participate, on a grant-in-aid basis, in programs of soil conservation technical assistance.
3. Recommends that soil conservation payments be placed on a grant-in-aid basis with the States assuming a part of the costs.
4. Recommends that intergovernmental relations responsibilities for inspection and grading activities be clarified including the use of cross-certification by the National and State enforcement authorities.
5. Recommends that the possibility be explored of distributing surplus agriculture commodities through commercial instead of governmental channels, perhaps through a food certificate plan.

- *1. Recommends tightening up of regulations covering vehicles used in the interstate transportation of migrants.

None

8. Atomic Energy

None

- *1. Recommends amending the Atomic Energy Act to grant to the States a greater share of the responsibility for the promotion and regulation of the peaceful uses of atomic energy, particularly in the fields of health and safety.
- *2. Recommends amendment to State workmen's compensation laws to take cognizance of radiation hazards.

None

Governmental Function
or Activity

"Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955)

Joint Federal-State Action Committee
(1957-60)

-
- | Governmental Function
or Activity | "Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955) | Joint Federal-State Action Committee
(1957-60) |
|--|---|---|
| 9. Natural Disasters | *1. Recommends that Federal financial assistance for disaster relief be extended to any State or local government only after the State has passed a law or through other action which obligates it and such local governments to pay a proportionate share of disaster relief expenditures from State or State and local funds. | *1. Recommends establishment of schedule of minimum expenditures to be made by State and local subdivisions in meeting natural disasters before Federal financial aid would be available. |
| 10. Education Beyond High School | None | *1. Recommends that all States undertake or extend studies of educational problems as a basis for future action, with particular attention to future enrollment, teaching staff requirements, sources of financing, physical plant requirements, and the respective roles of public and private institutions of higher education. |
| 11. Waste Treatment Facilities and Water Pollution Abatement | *1. Recommends that study be given to the initiation of a program of Federal financial assistance, for a limited time, for construction of pollution abatement facilities.

2. Recommends that States vigorously enforce anti-pollution laws and expand and improve their legislation in this field.

*3. Recommends that National Government give technical and financial assistance to State and interstate pollution control agencies. | 1. Recommends transfer to States of recently initiated program of financial assistance for construction of local waste treatment facilities (in conjunction with telephone tax credit arrangement listed under B(2) above). |
-

Governmental Function
or Activity

"Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955)

Joint Federal-State Action Committee
(1957-60)

12. Housing and Urban
Renewal

1. Recommends considerably increased responsibility by State governments in this field but with continuation of Federal help with certain modifications.
2. Recommends that where States gear up legally and financially to carry part of the load, Federal grants to localities in such States flow through the State.
- *3. Recommends that States and municipalities create metropolitan planning agencies.
4. Recommends that in planning future slum clearance and public housing projects all levels of government seriously consider problem of urban decentralization for defense.

1. Recommends increased activity and responsibility by the States with a view to making housing and urban renewal a Federal-State-local endeavor rather than essentially a Federal-local one as at present.
2. Except for eventual assumption by States for urban renewal planning advances, recommends continuation of active Federal role in this field.

13. Civil Defense

- *1. Recommends reallocation of function to convey increased share of responsibility to National Government.
- *2. Recommends Federal financial participation in State and local civil defense administrative costs.
3. Recommends increased State and local participation in national planning for reducing urban vulnerability to attack.

- *1. Endorses legislation aimed at placing increased responsibility for civil defense upon the National Government.

14. Flood Insurance

None

1. Recommends continued negotiation by Federal agencies, States and other interested parties to work out acceptable legislation to amend the presently inoperative Act.

Governmental Function
or Activity

"Kestnbaum" Commission
(1955)

15. Civil Aviation

1. Recommends continuation of Federal grants for airport construction.
 2. Recommends Congressional reevaluation of the need for Federal aid to smaller airports.
 3. Recommends that States consider creation of regional airport authorities, such as the New York Port of Authority.
-

16. Elementary and Secondary
Education

1. Recommends continuation of commodity grants by tapering off of cash grants by the Federal Government for school lunches.
 2. Recommends continuation of Federal grants for school construction and operation in "federally impacted" areas.
 3. Recommends that States and localities continue to bear responsibilities for providing general public education; recommends against a general program of Federal aid to elementary and secondary education.
 4. Recognizes possible need of Federal aid for school construction in particular States, based upon a clear finding of need and lack of resources.
-

17. Natural Resources and
Conservation

1. Recommends establishment of a Board of Review to advise the President and the Congress on a coordinated natural resources policy within the National Government and between it and the States.
 2. Recommends designation or establishment by each State of a natural resources advisory council.
-